

Kostas Chatzikokolakis and Carmela Troncoso

# Editors' Introduction

DOI 10.2478/popets-2019-0055

It is our great pleasure to introduce the fourth issue of the sixth volume of PoPETS, an open access journal that publishes articles accepted to the annual Privacy Enhancing Technologies Symposium (PETS). Recognizing the need to increase the free, public availability of scientific publications, PoPETS is published under the open-access Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs license.

Since 2015 PoPETS/PETS follows the hybrid conference-journal model started by PVLDB, and now adopted by many other conferences in the field such as FSE, CHES, the IEEE Security and Privacy Symposium and the USENIX Security Symposium. This model has improved the quality of the published articles as well as both reviewers' and authors' experience regarding the review process. By enabling the resubmission of articles once comments from previous reviews have been addressed PoPETS provides a more predictable path to acceptance for authors while maintaining a high quality rigorous peer-review process.

PoPETS double-blind peer review process is similar to other top-tier computer security conferences, including phases for desk rejection, bidding, reviews, author rebuttals, discussion among reviewers, and consensus recommendation. By having four issues per year, and enabling resubmissions, PoPETS hopes to improve the quality of the published articles as well as the peer-review experience for both authors and reviewers.

Articles submitted to this issue were reviewed by 111 members of the Editorial Board and 86 External Reviewers. The submitted articles, reviews, and discussion were available to all members of the editorial board that did not have a conflict of interest with the authors of the article. To identify conflicts of interest, the editorial board membership was published before submissions were opened and authors were asked to indicate members with whom any of the authors had a conflict of interest. In addition, editorial board mem-

bers were asked to list the authors and institutions with which they have conflicts of interest. Finally, the editorial board chairs also checked for missed conflicts. Editorial board members were welcome to submit articles, while the chairs were precluded from doing so.

There were 91 submissions to this issue of PoPETS. Ten of the 91 submissions had been invited to resubmit after major revision in a previous issue, which were re-assigned to the editorial board members that had reviewed the previous version. Additionally, nine articles that had been rejected from a previous issue were re-submitted to the journal, and were re-assigned to the same reviewers whenever possible. For all these resubmissions the authors provided a summary of changes between the prior and current version that explained how review concerns had been addressed.

In the fourth issue of 2019 we continued the consistency experiment started in the previous issue.<sup>1</sup> The experiment consists in the following: we split the PC in two: PC-A and PC-B, making sure that both contain representative expertise in the topics relevant to PoPETS. Then, we randomly selected 20 newly submitted papers (i.e., we excluded resubmissions) to be reviewed by both PCs, and the remainder were assigned to one of the two committees uniformly at random. Members of each PC did not know whether a paper they review is also being reviewed by the other PC or not. Both PCs ran as usual, with the same phases and deadlines. At the end of the decision phase, we took the best of the two decisions for the paper, i.e. always benefit the authors, to avoid making them feel uneasy with the experiment. Authors were informed about whether their paper would get two sets of reviews or not.

In this issue, we substituted the 'fast check' performed in issues 2 and 3, aimed at clarifying whether papers were not on scope, by a short review round in which we assigned two reviewers to *all* papers. After this round we rejected all papers that had two reject scores (Reject or Reject and Resubmit). Non rejected paper received four individual reviews (in a few cases, articles received three or more than four reviews; also, duplicated papers received two sets of reviews). Most articles had an external review drawn from a pool of

---

**Kostas Chatzikokolakis:** CNRS, E-mail:

kostas@lix.polytechnique.fr

**Carmela Troncoso:** EPFL, E-mail: carmela.troncoso@epfl.ch

---

<sup>1</sup> <https://petsymposium.org/experiment.php>

young experts proposed by the community<sup>2</sup>. Further external experts were invited to review certain articles where necessary. The reviews were sent to authors, who were given the opportunity to submit a rebuttal. After the rebuttal period there was a discussion among the reviewers, other members of the editorial board and the chairs to reach a consensus decision for each paper. One of the reviewers was then selected to write a meta-review that summarized the conclusion of the discussion and the justification for the decision.

Of the 91 submissions, six papers were accepted with minor changes and ten were conditionally accepted subject to minor revisions. For the latter, a reviewer was assigned as a shepherd to ensure that the important points from the meta-review were addressed in the camera-ready version. Sixteen articles were ultimately accepted and are published in this issue and will be presented at PETS 2019, on July 16–20, 2019 in Stockholm, Sweden.

We desk rejected 9 papers for being out of scope, over the page limit, or non-anonymous; and 5 papers were withdrawn by the authors at some point during the process. Then, 21 papers were rejected after two reviews in the two rounds; 10 received a Reject, and 11 were invited to resubmit. After this round 28 other articles were invited to resubmit to a future issue of PoPETs. Twenty-one of them received a Major Revisions decision and, if submitted to one of the next PoPETs two submission deadlines, will be reviewed by the same reviewers who will judge if the major issues pointed in the meta-review are addressed. The remaining 17 received an encouraging meta-review that pointed revisions needed that were deemed too serious or too abstract to be addressed in short time. Finally, two papers were rejected due to them requiring a major rewriting that effectively results in a new paper, or due to not being considered sufficiently close to the topics listed in the call for papers.

Fifteen of the 16 accepted articles in Issue 4 of this 2019 volume (one of the papers was moved to PETS 2020 so that the shepherding procedure can be completed), and the 51 articles published in Issues 1, 2, and 3, formed the program for PETS 2019, to be held on July 16–20, 2019 in Stockholm, Sweden. For all four 2019 issues combined, there were 300 submissions (of which 40 were major revisions and 21 were resubmitted reject-and-resubmit), 67 accepted papers (of which 36 were major revisions and 4 were resubmitted reject-and-

resubmit), and 50 papers were given a Major Revision decision.

We also continue to host the one-day Workshop on Hot Topics on Privacy Enhancing Technologies (HotPETs), now in its twelfth year. HotPETs encourages the lively discussion of exciting but possibly preliminary ideas. As with previous years there are no published proceedings for HotPETs, allowing authors to refine their work based on feedback received and publish it at a future PETS or elsewhere.

We thank the following people for making the fourth issue of PoPETs Volume 2019 possible:

#### General Chair for PETS 2019:

- Panagiotis Papadimitratos, KTH
- Simone Fischer-Hübner, Karlstad University

#### Program Committee Chairs / Editors in Chief:

- Kostas Chatzikokolakis, CNRS
- Carmela Troncoso, IMDEA Software Institute

#### Program Committee / Editorial Board:

- Abdelrahman Aly, imec-COSIC, KU Leuven
- Ahmad-Reza Sadeghi, Technische Universität Darmstadt
- Alan Mislove, Northeastern University
- Alfredo Rial, University of Luxembourg
- Alptekin Küpçü, Koç University
- Amir Herzberg, University of Connecticut and Bar Ilan University
- Amir Houmansadr, University of Massachusetts Amherst
- Ananth Raghunathan, Google Brain
- Aniket Kate, Purdue University
- Anna Squicciarini, Penn State University
- Anupam Das, North Carolina State University
- Apu Kapadia, Indiana University Bloomington
- Arvind Narayanan, Princeton University
- Ashwin Machanavajjhala, Duke University
- Bart Preneel, KU Leuven
- Ben Zhao, University of Chicago
- Blase Ur, University of Chicago
- Bogdan Carbunar, Florida International University
- Boris Koepf, Microsoft Research
- Catuscia Palamidessi, INRIA
- Cecylia Bocovich, Tor Project
- Chang Liu, Berkeley
- Charalampos Papamanthou, University of Maryland

<sup>2</sup> <https://bit.ly/2gxVDd8>

- Chris Clifton, Purdue University
  - Claudio Orlandi, Aarhus University
  - Claudio Soriente, NEC
  - Cristina Onete, Universite de Limoges / XLIM
  - Daniel Zappala, Brigham Young University
  - Douglas Leith, Trinity College Dublin
  - Doug Tygar, UC Berkeley
  - Erman Ayday, Case Western Reserve University
  - Esfandiar Mohammadi, ETH Zurich
  - Eugene Vasserman, Kansas State University
  - Fabian Prasser, TU Munich
  - Florian Kerschbaum, University of Waterloo
  - Foteini Baldimtsi, George Mason University
  - Franziska Roesner, University of Washington
  - Gunes Acar, Princeton University
  - Hassan Takabi, University of North Texas
  - Igor Bilogrevic, Google
  - Ittay Eyal, Technion
  - Ivan Martinovic, University of Oxford
  - Jamie Hayes, UCL
  - Janne Lindqvist, Rutgers university
  - Jed Crandall, University of New Mexico
  - Jens Grossklags, Technical University of Munich
  - Joel Reardon, University of Calgary
  - Joris Van Hoboken, University of Amsterdam & Vrije Universiteit Brussels
  - Julien Freudiger, Apple
  - Kevin Bauer, MIT Lincoln Laboratory
  - Kévin Huguenin, Université de Lausanne
  - Lujo Bauer, Carnegie Mellon University
  - Marc Juarez, KU Leuven
  - Mario Alvim, Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais
  - Masha'el Al-Sabah, Qatar Computing Research Institute
  - Matthew Wright, RIT
  - Melek Önen, EURECOM
  - Melissa Chase, Microsoft Research
  - Michelle Mazurek, University of Maryland
  - Minhui Xue, Macquarie University and Data61-CSIRO
  - Narseo Vallina, IMDEA Networks Institute
  - Nataliia Bielova, INRIA
  - Nick Hopper, University of Minnesota
  - Nick Mathewson, Tor Project
  - Nick Sullivan, Cloudflare
  - Nicolas Papernot, Google Brain
  - Nikita Borisov, UIUC
  - Nina Taft, Google
  - Nitesh Saxena, University of Alabama at Birmingham
  - Panagiotis (Panos) Papadimitratos, KTH
  - Paolo Gasti, New York Institute of Technology
  - Patrick Loiseau, Inria
  - Paul Pearce, Georgia Tech; Facebook; International Computer Science Institute
  - Paul Syverson, U.S. Naval Research Laboratory
  - Pedro Moreno-Sanchez, TU Wien
  - Peter Kairouz, Google AI
  - Peter Schwabe, Radboud University
  - Philipp Jovanovic, EPFL
  - Philipp Winter, UC San Diego / CAIDA
  - Phillip Rogaway, UC Davis
  - Ponnurangam Kumaraguru, IIIT Delhi
  - Prateek Mittal, Princeton University
  - Rachel Greenstadt, Drexel University
  - Rebekah Overdorf, KU Leuven
  - Reza Shokri, National University of Singapore
  - Rinku Dewri, University of Denver
  - Rob Jansen, U.S. Naval Research Laboratory
  - Ruba Abu-Salma, University College London (UCL)
  - Sadia Afroz, ICSI / Berkeley
  - Sarah Meiklejohn, University College London
  - Scott Coull, FireEye
  - Sebastian Angel, University of Pennsylvania
  - Sébastien Gambs, Université du Québec à Montréal (UQAM)
  - Serge Egelman, ICSI / Berkeley
  - Shruti Tople, Microsoft Research
  - Stefanie Roos, TU Delft
  - Stefan Katzenbeisser, TU Darmstadt
  - Steven Murdoch, University College London
  - Susan Landau, Tufts University
  - Susan McGregor, Tow Center for Digital Journalism & Columbia Journalism School
  - Takao Murakami, National Institute of Advanced Industrial Science and Technology (AIST)
  - Tara Whalen, Google
  - Tariq Elahi, University of Edinburgh
  - Theresa Stadler, Privitar
  - Thomas Roessler, Google
  - Thomas Zacharias, University of Edinburgh
  - Travis Mayberry, U.S. Naval Academy
  - Wouter Lueks, EPFL
  - Yoshi Kohno, University of Washington
  - Yossi Gilad, MIT
  - Zubair Shafiq, University of Iowa
- Publications Chairs:**
- Vasilios Mavroudis
  - Philip Winter

**Video Chair:**

- Aaron Johnson
- Ryan Henry

**Publicity Chairs:**

- Rebekah Overdorf
- Kat Hanna

**Web Chairs:**

- Ian Goldberg
- Kat Hanna

**Sponsorship Chairs:**

- Steven Murdoch
- Rachel Greenstadt

**We thank the following shepherds:**

- Sebastian Angel
- Jens Grossklags
- Nick Hopper
- Markulf Kohlweiss
- Wei-Kai Lin
- Nick Mathewson
- Mohsen Minaei
- Sashank Narain
- Zubair Shafiq
- Peter Schwabe
- Shruti Tople

**We thank the following proof reviewer:**

- Markulf Kohlweiss

**We thank the following external reviewers:**

- Yasemin Acar
- Muhammad Ajmal
- Mete Akgün
- Ghous Amjad
- Pauline Anthonysamy
- Daniele Asoni
- Muhammad Ahmad Bashir
- Sruti Bhagavatula
- Jorge Blasco Alis
- Spyros Boukoros
- Giovanni Cherubin
- Jessica Colnago
- Amit Datta
- Martin Degeling
- Benjamin Dowling
- Kasra Edalatnejad
- Pardis Emami-Naeini
- Imane Fouad
- David Froelicher
- Marco Gaboardi
- Gloria Gonzalez-Fuster
- Lachlan Gunn
- Cheng Guo
- Rafa Gálvez
- Inken Hagestedt
- Ariel Hamlin
- Marcella Hastings
- Ryan Henry
- Jens Hiller
- Danny Yuxing Huang
- Ágnes Kiss
- Bart Knijnenburg
- Nadim Kobeissi
- Bogdan Kulynych
- S. Daniel Li
- Changchang Liu
- Jian Liu
- Anindya Maiti
- Srdjan Matic
- Vasilios Mavroudis
- Sebastian Meiser
- Marcela Melara
- Kristopher Micinski
- Mohsen Minaei
- Brice Minaud
- Hooman Mohajeri Moghaddam
- Veelasha Moonsamy
- Christian Mouchet
- Pradeep Murukannaiah

- Sashank Narain
- Simon Oya
- Sai Teja Peddinti
- Zhiyun Qian
- Sazzadur Rahaman
- Shailesh Rangari
- Ruben Recabarren
- Elissa Redmiles
- Jingjing Ren
- Florentin Rochet
- Ahmed Salem
- Suranga Seneviratne
- Fatemeh Shirazi
- Anastasia Shuba
- Payap Sirinam
- Dolière Francis Somé
- Oleksii Starov
- Yixin Sun
- Sanaz Taheri Boshrooyeh
- Om Dipakbhai Thakkar
- Rafael Toledo
- Luke Valenta
- Cédric Van Rompay
- Daniel Votipka
- Ryan Wails
- Tianhao Wang
- Ding Wang
- Janith Weerasinghe
- Primal Wijesekera
- Ren Zhang
- Yongjun Zhao
- Jan Henrik Ziegeldorf

We would like to thank the KTH Royal Institute of Technology for hosting the Privacy Enhancing Technology Symposium where the papers of Volume 2019 were presented. We would also like to thank the Platinum Sponsors of the PETS event: Ford Foundation, the National Science Foundation and ZCash. We would also like to thank our gold sponsors: Google and Facebook, our silver sponsors: Sharemind and Comcast, and our in-kind sponsor: Tor.

We would like also like to thank all the PETS and HotPETs authors, especially those who presented their work that was selected for the program, as well as the rump session presenters, keynote speakers, and panelists.

Finally, we are happy to introduce Aaron Johnson as the new Co-Editor-in-Chief for the current and next volumes, starting in the first issue of 2020. Kostas Chatzikokolakis will continue to serve as Co-Editor-in-

Fig. 1. PETS 2019 - Sponsors



Chief for this the 2019 volume. We thank Carmela Troncoso for her service as Co-Editor-in-Chief for Volumes 2018 and 2019.

Sincerely,

Kostas Chatzikokolakis and Carmela Troncoso

Program Co-Chairs of PETS 2019 and Co-Editors-in-Chief of PoPETs volume 2019.